

Report of the Faculty Committee on ROTC

April 19, 2011

Introduction

Dean Mary Miller sent an email message to Yale College students on March 29, 2011, announcing the appointment of the Faculty Committee on Reserve Officers' Training Corps (ROTC) chaired by Professor Gary Haller, and including Professors O. Keith Baker, James Levinsohn, Linda Peterson, and Vice President and University General Counsel Dorothy Robinson. Joy McGrath, Special Assistant to the Provost, served as staff to the Committee and William Whobrey, Associate Dean of Yale College and Adviser to ROTC, acted as adviser and resource on ROTC for the Committee. The Committee was charged with reviewing the decisions made by Yale's faculty in 1969 and 1970¹, which created academic and financial barriers that caused both the Army and Navy ROTC programs to leave campus. A reading of the minutes of those faculty meetings (and there were several, spread over the spring and fall terms of 1969) reminds us of the anger and agony many in the faculty felt and expressed at the time of the Vietnam War. Conscription of Yale students into the military (the all volunteer military ensued in 1973) is an evident corollary issue in the Yale debate on the status of ROTC (as reflected in the Yale College Programs of Study description of ROTC and the resolutions discussed by the faculty). These resolutions were

¹ In fact, the minutes of Yale College Faculty meetings reflect that faculty actions were confined to 1969 and in 1970 both the Army and the Navy announced they would phase out Yale ROTC programs.

adopted by the Yale College Faculty and endorsed by the Yale Corporation by the end of 1969 (the resolutions are quoted in the context of recommended replacement resolutions below). It is worth noting here that the Yale College faculty, in 1969, did not use the argument of equal rights for gays and lesbians as a reason to dissuade ROTC from remaining on campus. The repeal of Don't Ask, Don't Tell (DADT), is a factor in our considering the return of ROTC to the campus.

There is not enough public comment by the Yale College Faculty to judge the majority opinion on ROTC, but the committee believes we do have a clear sense of current undergraduate opinion on the issue. The Yale College Council Committee on ROTC, in their report of January 2011, indicated that 67.8% of respondents (1,346 students) would be in favor of the return of ROTC to the Yale campus in the wake of the repeal of DADT. Only 16.5% are opposed, and the rest are indifferent. At about the same time, the Dean of Yale College, the University Counsel, and the University Secretary met with representatives of the Air Force to explore the conditions under which the re-establishment of ROTC at Yale might be considered by the military. This meeting was sufficiently encouraging to allow Dean Miller to appoint our committee and announce our charge (email to students dated March 29, 2011) to re-examine Yale College's faculty decisions in 1969 and 1970, specifically with regard to:

1. The revocation² of academic credit for ROTC courses;
2. The revocation² of the possibility of faculty appointment for ROTC instructors;
3. The revocation² of Yale's commitment to financial aid for students admitted with ROTC scholarships who subsequently withdrew from the program;
4. A requirement that ROTC pay for the full costs of any ROTC program and building usage.

Below we will briefly discuss the historical context of each of these issues as a preamble to a replacement resolution we recommend to the Yale College Faculty.

Committee Activities

The Chair of the Committee and staff/adviser to the Committee met with two groups of students before the first meeting of the full Committee, and the minutes of those meetings were incorporated into our meetings record and informed our discussion. One group of students was comprised of the four undergraduates who currently participate in the Yale off-campus ROTC program. The ROTC students largely discussed their experiences, as well as the respect they are accorded by their peers, in very positive terms. A second group of students represented the Yale LGBTQ Affinity Group and spoke to us of their concern, that the repeal of DADT does not remove discrimination

² In 1 and 2 “revocation” is used with reference to actions taken by the Yale College Faculty in 1969; in 3 “revocation” is used with reference to a commitment of financial aid made in 1969 when Yale students were subject to conscription but perhaps is not needed or expected in the context of a volunteer military.

by the military against transgender and gender non-conforming people whereas the Yale University's Equal Opportunity Statement includes the statement "...nor does Yale discriminate on the basis of sexual orientation or gender identity or expression.

The full committee met three times and continued to refine this report and our resolutions by email. While we did not explicitly discuss it in our meetings, it seems implicit in our charge that the Committee should consider possible replacement resolutions (in the words of one of our members) to "untie the hands of the administration" to negotiate with the military for the return of ROTC to the Yale Campus. It was, however, understood that the goal was to present replacement resolutions that would fit within current Yale College policy on standards for course credit toward a Yale degree, titles and procedure for faculty appointments, and financial aid for students admitted to Yale College. Although the allocation of resources among departments and programs in Yale College is the prerogative of the Office of the Provost, we further understood that our replacement recommendations must be sensitive to the current state of the Yale budget and respectful of the proposed contraction of resources to departments and programs in Yale College in the coming academic years.

Background Information on ROTC

Here we present a review of peer practices (other Ivies plus Stanford and MIT) with regard to credit for ROTC courses, kind of appointment used for a cadre of ROTC instructors, and facilities and support

requirements for an on-campus ROTC Program. In all three areas there are complexities that cannot be easily summarized or conveyed in simple tabular form, but this information is a useful background on which the faculty may project our replacement resolutions.

	Full Program on Campus	Academic Credit for Courses	Faculty Appointment
Stanford			
Harvard			
Columbia			
Brown			
Dartmouth			
Princeton	X		(X)
Penn	X	X	
Cornell	X	X	X
MIT	X	X	X

Academic Credit for ROTC Courses

Five of the nine universities considered do not have ROTC programs on their campuses – Stanford, Harvard, Columbia, Brown, Dartmouth (and Yale). These universities all have consortial relations with other universities, however, and their students participate in ROTC programs at other host institutions. None accepts academic credit for ROTC courses. Dartmouth does have some elements of a program on campus, although the program is officially hosted by Norwich University. Harvard recently agreed to a Navy ROTC presence on its campus, but students will continue to train at MIT.

Four of the nine universities considered have one or more full ROTC programs on their campuses – Cornell, Princeton, Penn, and MIT. Some kind of academic credit for ROTC courses is granted by three of these – Cornell, Penn, and MIT. Cornell grants credit for most courses, with restrictions imposed by some majors. Courses in the first two years of the program count as 1 credit hour, those in the second two years count as 3 credit hours each. At Penn, some schools (Wharton, Nursing, and Engineering and Applied Science) accept credit for one or more courses. At MIT credit is limited to a single course, NS 401, Leadership and Management, for which credit can also be petitioned at Harvard. Princeton does not accept academic credit for ROTC courses.

Appointments for Military Instructors

Only those universities with ROTC programs on campus are relevant to the appointment process of military cadre as faculty. Of the four institutions that have full programs on campus, two have a regular appointment process for military personnel who teach ROTC courses – Cornell and MIT. Princeton has an adhoc process.

At Cornell, courtesy and visiting appointments are made based on the criteria outlined in the table at Appendix 1. MIT appoints its military instructors as visiting faculty. The ROTC unit commander is given the title of Visiting Professor. At Princeton, a military instructor may be given faculty rank based on his or her credentials. Penn is part of the Philadelphia NROTC Consortium, and it does not provide military

instructors with a faculty appointment. The unit commander at Villanova also acts as commander of the Penn program.

Facilities and Support Requirements

Of the four universities with on-campus programs, all provide some sort of facilities and administrative support. This varies considerably, although all universities make classrooms and some office space available. Most also provide an administrative assistant for the ROTC program, and most provide some minimal level of operational budget support, usually up to \$10,000. This kind of support is considered common, and the ROTC programs that Yale partners with at the University of Connecticut receive similar support from that university. Harvard recently agreed to provide office space for Navy ROTC on its campus.

The need for weapons storage on campus also varies greatly, although many programs have no such requirement at all. At Cornell Air Force ROTC, for example, eliminated their demilitarized rifles and now use replicas for their color guard. Since these are not real weapons, they do not require any special storage at all. Other programs make arrangements for storage at the university armory or local police department.

1969 Resolutions and Recommended Replacements

1. The original granting of credit for ROTC courses that “involve learning activities” was approved by the Course of Study Committee and the Yale

College Faculty in December 1916. The number and kind of courses given credit evolved between 1916 and 1969 and differed between the Army and the Navy programs. By way of example, we quote from the 1969 Yale College Programs of Study for the Navy ROTC.

All courses of the Naval Science curriculum are awarded regular degree credit as elective courses with the exception of laboratory periods taught by the Navy faculty...the Naval Science curriculum includes the following courses taught by civilian faculty:

Mathematics: Two terms of calculus and/or statistics; e. g., Mathematics 10a and 15b, Mathematics 15b and higher, or Economics 25 or 29.

Science: Two terms of either physics, chemistry, biological, or earth science.

Computer Science: One term; e. g. E.&A. S. 12a, 10a or 54a.

History: A one-term course related to United State military affairs; e .g, History 32a, 81b or *CSTD 12b.

Political Science: A one-term course dealing with the formulation and implementation of American security policy and elements of national power; e. g., Political Science 31a, 32b or *CSTC 20a.

It should be understood that “civilian faculty” refers to regular Yale College Faculty, and the courses were regular departmental offerings in 1969. But even some of the 1969 courses taught by Navy faculty would appear, on the face of their Yale College Programs of Study descriptions,

to be courses that would receive approval by the Course of Study Committee today, e.g.,

Naval Science 402b, Naval Engineering. Lieut. E. J.

Weaving.

41. M, W, F, 9.10.

42. M, W, F, 10.10

Basic thermodynamic principles and processes are introduced. The principles of chemical, thermal, and nuclear energy conversions are studied in relation to steam, diesel, and gas turbine engines. Operating principles of propulsion systems and their control devices are explored.

Thus, it seems reasonable to state that any course required by a ROTC program that would utilize courses offered and taught by Yale College faculty would be given credit as long as the program met major, distribution, and other degree requirements. Likewise, if a faculty member wished to revise his/her course to accommodate the ROTC Program, such revised courses would likely be acceptable for degree credit as well. Courses taught by ROTC faculty and approved by the Course of Study Committee for degree credit might be restricted in number in the same way that some other courses are, e.g., not more than two courses from another university or not more than four residential college seminars, count toward the undergraduate degrees requirements in Yale College.

In January 1969 the Course of Study Committee moved approval of the resolution:

It is the sense of the Faculty of Yale College that the training of

students for military commissions under the auspices of the Army and Navy ROTC units should be given extra-curricular status without academic credit.

Replacement Resolution recommended to the Yale College Faculty:

All courses offered by ROTC programs at Yale (currently the Army and the Air Force) will be given enrollment credit, where the courses appear on the transcript, perhaps with a grade, but do not count towards a degree or a major. Those courses that are offered in the ROTC Program and have the usual elements of Yale College courses may be submitted to the Course of Study Committee by the Dean of Yale College, and if approved by the Committee and the Faculty, they would also appear as courses that count towards a degree.

2. In 1969 the Course of Study Committee argued that if courses that were offered in ROTC were “given extra-curricular status without academic credit,” it followed that the status of the instructors of those courses would also change. Thus, the resolution continued:

To reflect this altered status the Commanding Officers of these units should be designated by a title indicating that they do not have the academic authority usually associated with a professorship.

Federal law and applicable DOD instructions provide that the Commanding Officer of ROTC units must be provided a faculty title indicating a rank equivalent to professor, and other instructing officers must be provided ranks equivalent to assistant professor. Not all host institutions have resolved this issue in the same manner; that is, while

some allow a title of “professor of military science,” others have used the title of “visiting professor,” and we believe that “adjunct professor” might also qualify as an equivalent. This could be a term appointment perhaps for a period of three to five years for the Commanding Officer and perhaps annual one-year appointments for other ROTC instructors. The current Yale University Faculty Handbook describes the ranks of Professor Adjunct (Assistant Professor, Associate Professor and Professor Adjunct, depending on qualifications and experience) as follows: “In the Faculty of Arts and Sciences, the adjunct ranks are appropriate for the appointment of individuals with special qualifications who play important roles in the teaching of undergraduate or graduate students, but who may not be fully engaged in the research activities characteristic of ladder faculty in disciplines represented by Yale’s Faculty of Arts and Sciences departments and programs.” There is a Yale College Faculty Handbook process for appointments in the Adjunct ranks, but there is a second option described in the Yale Corporation Bylaws, see <http://www.yale.edu/about/bylaws.html>. We quote, in part, Section 47 of the Bylaws on Appointments and Assignments:

47. Appointments to the ranks of professor, associate professor, assistant professor, and any other ranks as may be transmitted by the President shall be made by the Corporation. All such appointments shall be made upon nomination by the President, or upon nominations approved and transmitted by the President and made by the Board of Permanent Officers or other Governing Board of a school, or, in the case of Yale College and the Graduate School,

by a joint meeting of the Board of Permanent Officers. Appointment to other ranks may be approved by the President after nominations made by the Departments and Academic Programs and approved by appropriate committees or boards. A nomination for appointment of any person to be a member of a Department or Academic Program represented in Yale College or in the Graduate School, unless made by the President, shall be made by the Department or Academic Program. If authorized by the President, an Academic Program may nominate persons for a limited number of ladder faculty appointments.

Replacement Resolution recommended to the Yale College Faculty:

The Commanding Officer associated with a Yale ROTC program, as well as other instructors in ROTC, depending on their qualifications and experience, may be considered for the ranks of Professor Adjunct, Associate Professor Adjunct, and Assistant Professor Adjunct. Instructors in ROTC who do not qualify for an adjunct rank may be appointed as Lecturer or Senior Lecturer, according to the criteria described in the Yale University Faculty Handbook. An ROTC Faculty Committee, appointed by the Dean of Yale College, will review the qualifications of individuals nominated by the military and recommend an appropriate rank. The recommendation of this Committee, for an Adjunct or Lecturer appointment in the ROTC Program, would be transmitted to the Yale College Dean who would generally make a nomination for appointment to the President, as described in the Yale Corporation Bylaws, "Appointment to other ranks may be

approved by the President after nominations made by the Departments and Academic Programs and approved by appropriate committees or boards,” where the appropriate program is the ROTC Program and the appropriate committee is the ROTC Faculty Committee appointed by the Dean of Yale College. These appointments would normally be in Yale College.

3. The Yale College need-blind admission policy provides generous financial aid to all students that have demonstrated need. That aid is adjusted as the circumstances of need change. Thus, it seems fair that if a student’s circumstances change because of his or her change in contractual arrangement for participation in ROTC, that student would be offered financial aid on the basis of need in the same manner as any other Yale student. The resolution, as amended on the floor of a Yale College Faculty meeting in May, 1969, reads:

If a student withdraws or is separated from ROTC, he should receive financial aid from Yale when necessary to enable him to remain in college. He should also receive aid from the University when necessary to help him meet his financial obligations if repayment of benefits should be required.

Replacement Resolution recommended to the Yale College Faculty:

A student who withdraws or is separated from ROTC may apply to receive Yale financial aid, on the basis of need, under the same rules that now apply to any other Yale College student.

4. In 1917 Yale provided or was given extensive facilities and resources to initiate ROTC. This included Artillery Hall (erected by the University at a cost of \$35,000), the Yale Armory, a gift of graduates (erected at a cost of \$135,000), 62 horses from the government and graduates, and two cutters with full equipment received from the Portsmouth Navy Yard and set up in Mason Mechanical Engineering Laboratory for instruction purposes. The resolution, as amended on the floor of a Yale College Faculty meeting in May, 1969, reads:

The committee recommends that arrangements be made to insure that the ROTC cover the full instructional and administrative costs of their programs and also pay an appropriate amount of building usage.

For the current off-campus Army (instruction provided at the University of New Haven) and Air Force (instruction provided at the University of Connecticut at Storrs, which provides an operations budget for the Air Force program) ROTC programs, the President's Office provides a modest budget for transportation costs (approximately \$6,900 annually), the Yale College Dean's Office provides administrative support under the auspices of Associate Dean William Whobrey, Adviser to ROTC, and a website is maintained by the Yale College Dean's Office and Yale Information Technology Services (<http://www.yale.edu/rotc/>). It is understood that a host institution for an on-campus ROTC program is expected to provide an administrative assistant and a basic office for the program; classrooms are also needed for instruction courses (sometimes also labeled laboratories) offered in ROTC.

Replacement Resolution recommended to the Yale College Faculty:

An office and an administrative assistant, or equivalent administrative services as an expansion of those now provided by an Associate Dean of Yale College, should be provided by the Yale College Dean's Office as part of a contract with the military for an ROTC Program on campus. Yale College (and/or Offices of the Secretary and General Counsel) carrying out negotiations with the military for the return of ROTC to campus may, of course, make other appropriate allowances for facilities usage and program costs, presumably in consultation with the Provost and President. Classroom assignment will be provided by the Registrar's Office on the same basis as credit courses in Yale College.

APPENDIX 1

Cornell University Military Instructor Appointments

University Title	Guidelines	Military Qualifications	Departmental Functions
Courtesy Professor	Commanding officers will be appointed to the academic title of Courtesy Professor and can be appointed to the term of assignment unless terminated by the university.	LTC or Higher in accordance with the bylaws.	Dept Chair, teach courses for credit, advise and administrative mgt. duties.
Courtesy Associate Professor	Used in very occasional circumstances, must have a Masters (prefer PhD) for this title or a waiver from the Vice Provost or Undergraduate Education. Can be appointed to the term of assignment unless terminated by the university.	15 or more years of military service/Dept Executive Officer /Commandant of Cadets.	Teach courses for credit, administrative mgt. duties and advise.
Visiting Senior Lecturer	Commissioned officers and non-commissioned officers, whose primary duty is to teach classes that students take for credit, will be appointed to the academic titles of Visiting Senior Lecturer or Visiting Lecturer (depending on military qualifications).*	Officer with 8 or more years of military service or NCO w/bachelor or higher degree.	Teach courses for credit and advise.
Visiting Lecturer	Commissioned officers and non-commissioned officers, whose primary duty is to teach classes that students take for credit, will be appointed to the academic titles of Visiting Lecturer (depending on military qualifications).**	Officer with 4 years of service or NCO with 10 years of service.	Teach courses for credit and advise.
ROTC Support Staff	Non-commissioned/enlisted personnel performing administrative work will be appointed to a newly created non-academic title of "ROTC Support Staff" and can be appointed to term that will match the length of their military assignment. The civilian government employees will be covered under this title as well.	Military orders or appointment through National Security Personnel System.	Administrative duties.